

# Mandatory Reporting Laws in the United States: Impact on Victims of Intimate Partner Violence

October 16, 2018 at 2-3:30pm CDT



This project was supported by Grant No. 2015-TA-AX-K027 awarded by the Office on Violence Against Women, U.S. Department of Justice. The opinions, findings, conclusions, and recommendations expressed in this (document/program/exhibit) are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Department of Justice, Office on Violence Against Women.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

# Mandatory Reporting Laws in the United States

Carol E. Jordan, Executive Director  
Office for Policy Studies on Violence Against Women  
University of Kentucky  
[caroli@uky.edu](mailto:caroli@uky.edu)

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

# Mandatory Reporting Laws in the United States

## Presentation Overview

- History and Types of Mandatory Reporting Laws
- Mandatory Reporting Laws Applied to Cases of Intimate Partner Violence
- Research on Mandatory Reporting: Views of Women
- Legislative Reform: The Kentucky Experience
- Legislative Advocacy: What States Can Do

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### History of Mandatory Reporting Laws

- Over the past 8 decades, states across the nation have passed legislation to mandate reports of:
  - Specific types of criminal conduct
  - Abuse of vulnerable persons
- The purpose was two-fold:
  - Public or community safety
  - Protection of individual children or adults



---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Types of Mandatory Reporting Laws

- Four types of mandatory reporting laws passed by states:
  - Injuries associated with the commission of a crime or from use of a weapon;
  - Abuse, neglect, or dependency of children;
  - Abuse, neglect, or exploitation of vulnerable adults; and
  - Domestic violence (*intimate partner violence*)



---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Crime-Injury Reporting Laws

- Early 1940s, states began enacting legislation to require reports of injuries associated with a crime or resulting from use of a weapon
- By 2016, 46 states had crime-injury reporting laws
- Reports made to statutorily identified law enforcement
- Duty placed on health care professionals or hospitals

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Crime-Injury Reporting Laws

- States identify crime broadly or narrowly:
- Broad application states: e.g., a patient has had physical injury or injuries inflicted by non-accidental means
- Narrow application states: e.g., injuries resulting from the discharge of a firearm (most common), use of knife, or arson



---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Crime-Injury Reporting Laws

- How crime-injury reporting laws impact victims of domestic violence
- Indirectly impacts all cases because domestic violence is a crime and does involve weapons
- Direct impacts in two crime-injury states that specify that domestic violence must be reported (California, Colorado)
- Three states have specific exceptions for DV and/or sexual assault in their crime-injury reporting laws (New Hampshire, Pennsylvania, Tennessee)

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Child and Adult Abuse Reporting Laws

- Concept of mandating reports of abuse against children or vulnerable adults based on 2 principles:
- Certain persons are unable to protect themselves
- State government has role in intervention and protection
- History of abuse reporting:
  - Between 1963 -1967, all 50 states adopted some form of child protection laws (Meyers, 2008)
  - In 1970s states began passing laws to improve responses to vulnerable adults who by virtue of age or physical/mental disability were unable to care for themselves

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Stand-Alone Domestic Violence Reporting Laws

- In late 1970s, the first stand-alone state law passed to apply mandatory reporting to domestic violence (Kentucky)
- Purpose of domestic violence mandatory reporting law:
  - Aid battered women in reaching out for support and protection without the burden of reporting themselves
  - Increase the involvement of law enforcement
  - Send signal to offenders that domestic violence violates a community standard and won't be tolerated
  - Data collection

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Stand-Alone Domestic Violence Reporting Laws

- For many years, Kentucky was only stand-alone mandatory reporting state
  - Passed in 1978 with no exceptions
  - Significantly amended in 2017
- Oklahoma passed stand-alone mandatory reporting law for domestic violence in 2005
  - Exceptions if the victim is over 18 and competent
  - Reports are made if a victim requests it
  - Physicians must document domestic violence in medical records

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Research Finding on the Views of Women

- *Caveat: problems with the literature*
- Support for MR laws higher among non-abused women
- Some studies find narrow majority (e.g., 55.7%) of abused women support the law, but not against wishes of a patient
- Support the law in application to others, not themselves
- Women who support the law believe it sends a message to the offender and that it would make it easier to get help
- Women who raise concerns about the law say it would make the offender angrier, increase their risk, and/or make offender abuse them more

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Research Finding on the Views of Women

- Impact on help-seeking by women
  - Some studies find that 40-60% of women would not disclose violence to a health care provider if they knew that a mandatory reporting law existed (e.g., Gielen et al., 2000; Smith, 2000)
  - Other studies do not report such a dramatic impact
    - In one study of men and women, only 12% of patients said they would be less likely to seek medical care

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Why and How Kentucky Changed its Mandatory Reporting Law

- Kentucky law (KRS 209A.030)
  - Why law was created and by whom
  - Reports required by “any person” and all known or suspected cases had to be reported
  - Reports made to adult protective services agency; they, in turn, reported to law enforcement
  - Cabinet required by law to investigate “immediately”
  - Victims were not required to accept services
  - Failure to report was a Class B Misdemeanor

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Why and How Kentucky Changed its Mandatory Reporting Law

- Kentucky’s evaluation of its mandatory reporting law
  - Stories from the Kentucky DV programs (shelters)
  - University of Louisville study
    - Of the 24 women interviewed, 21% said their partner intercepted the initial contact by the social worker and 21% more said their partner found out later
  - Cabinet for Health and Family Services
    - The agency policy of sending letters
    - Reporting data from the Cabinet

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Why and How Kentucky Changed its Mandatory Reporting Law

- Data from the Cabinet for Health and Family Services (2012)
- Cabinet received 40,000 reports of DV annually
- Approximately 50% of DV reports not investigated because Cabinet cannot find/contact the victim
- Of investigated cases, over half of victims did not want the services of the Cabinet
- Only small percentage of cases resulted in protective services case being opened
  - E.g., 40 open DV cases and 13,000 open child protection cases

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Jordan & Pritchard, 2018

- Need for women's voices in our analysis led to research study
- Primary study aims:
  - Seek views of women related to mandatory reporting
  - Identify factors that influence women's opinions
  - Advance research and encourage application of study findings to improve state laws
- Methods
  - Collaboration with KY Coalition Against Domestic Violence
  - 388 women served by 15 domestic violence programs
  - Survey administered by program staff using instructions from research team

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Jordan & Pritchard, 2018

- Women in Kentucky's study
  - 82.7% White; 9% African American (study weakness)
  - Mean age 35 years old (why older than the general population of battered women?)
  - Half (49%) had at least one child living in home
  - Almost 2/3 (59.6%) unemployed; 12.4% on disability
  - Over half (56.2%) had high school diploma; 23.5% had college degree
  - 42.8% were single; 23.2% married but separated

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Jordan & Pritchard, 2018

- Survey instrument
  - Demographic information
  - What injuries had they sustained
  - Prior services they had used
  - Prior experiences with reporting law
  - What happened following the report
  - Opinions about mandatory reporting
  - Influence of mandatory reporting on help-seeking

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Jordan & Pritchard, 2018

- Results
  - If you knew in advance that the law required a report, would that impact the likelihood you would reach out?
    - 63.6% of women said they would be less likely to disclose abuse to a doctor or nurse
    - 59.7% of women said they would be less likely to disclose abuse to a therapist or counselor
    - 36% (2 in 5) women said they would be less likely to call or go to a domestic violence shelter
  - Overall opinion of mandatory reporting
    - 35.7% of women expressed support for the law
    - 52% preferred changes to the law, including giving a woman the right to refuse to have a report made

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Summary of Our Lessons

- Women expressing concerns about the law, including worry about losing children (opening of child protection cases)
- Advocates raising concerns about disempowerment
- Health and mental health professionals concerned about confidentiality
- Law did not result in increased protection services for women
- Law associated with increased risk (e.g., offenders finding out)
- Women less likely to reach out to shelters or to disclose their abuse to doctors/nurses/therapists if they knew about the law

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Challenges and Partnerships

- Challenges
  - Splits in advocacy community
  - Appearance of removing protections could generate opposition in legislators
- Partnerships
  - Building a coalition
  - Addressing opponents early
  - Selection of a legislative sponsor
  - Testimony – pairing of advocates and researchers

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## New Kentucky Law

- Purpose: identify victims; refer them to services; provide protective or therapeutic services to those who wish them
- Includes domestic violence (KRS 403.720(2)(5)) and dating violence (KRS 456.010(2))
- No longer “any person.” Defines “professionals” to mean:
  - *a physician, osteopathic physician, coroner, medical examiner, medical resident, medical intern, chiropractor, nurse, dentist, optometrist, emergency medical technician, paramedic, licensed mental health professional, therapist, cabinet employee, child-care personnel, teacher, school personnel, ordained minister or the denominational equivalent, victim advocate, or any organization or agency employing any of these professionals*

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## New Kentucky Law

- Removed mandatory reporting and replaced it with mandatory education and referral
  - Referral to DV Programs and Rape Crisis Centers
  - Information on how to access orders of protection
- Reports to law enforcement allowed with permission of victim
- Reports to law enforcement mandatory if death of victim
- Immunity provisions for professionals
- Violation is a Class B misdemeanor
- Stipulates that nothing would interfere with reporting child abuse or abuse of vulnerable adults

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



### What Can States Do?

- Know your state's statute and how it impacts victims of IPV
- Identify data sources to help make your case
  - National sources (e.g., research literature, CDC, DOJ)
  - State resources for data (e.g., DVPs, hospital data)
  - Develop partnership with a qualified researcher
- Select a statutory model for your state's legislative reform
  - If you have a crime-injury law, add exceptions for domestic violence (e.g., Pennsylvania)
  - With any type of mandatory reporting law, provide exception if victim requests that no report be made
  - Adding education/referral (e.g., Kentucky, North Dakota)
- Build a coalition of supporters
- Evaluate reforms

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### Mandatory Reporting of Domestic Violence

- For additional information:  
*Carol E. Jordan, Executive Director*  
*Office for Policy Studies on Violence Against Women*  
*University of Kentucky*  
[carolj@uky.edu](mailto:carolj@uky.edu)
- Jordan, C.E., & Pritchard, A.J. (2018). Mandatory reportage of domestic violence: What do abuse survivors think and what variables influence those opinions? *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---